



# CONTEXT-SENSITIVE SIGNAGE DESIGN

Marya Morris, Mark L. Hinshaw, Douglas Mace, Alan Weinstein



American Planning Association  
Planning Advisory Service

*Making Great Communities Happen*



*Marya Morris*



*Mark Hinshaw*



*Douglas Mace*



*Alan Weinstein*

Marya Morris, AICP, is a senior research associate at APA.

Mark L. Hinshaw, FAIA, FAICP, is principal and the director of urban design at LMN Architects, a 140-person firm in Seattle. For more than 27 years, he has been responsible for a wide range of project types in both large cities and small towns as an architect, city planner, and urban designer. He has provided urban design and community planning services to local governments, prepared master plans for public facilities, developed design guidelines and streetscape improvements for public agencies, and has created comprehensive commercial district plans. In addition, Hinshaw has served on the Seattle Design Commission, the Downtown Seattle Design Review Board, and is a past president of the Washington Chapter of the American Planning Association and the Seattle Chapter of the American Institute of Architects. He writes a regular column on architecture and urban design for *The Seattle Times* and his book, *Citistate Seattle: Shaping a Modern Metropolis*, is now available through bookstores.

Douglas Mace is a human factors engineer who has specialized for more than 30 years in highway safety, and has served as principal investigator of field research related to roadway lighting, highway visibility, traffic control devices, and driver attention. He is responsible for the research and development of the computer models that were the basis for FHWA's effort to determine minimum luminance requirements for the conspicuity and legibility of traffic signs. Mace is the author of "Transportation in an Aging Society" in *Sign Legibility and Conspicuity* in TRB/NRC Special Report 218. He has given several presentations relating on-premise signing to traffic safety including the keynote paper, "On-premise Signs and Traffic Safety," at a conference session at the Transportation Research Board's 1999 annual meeting.

Alan Weinstein holds a joint faculty appointment at the Maxine Goodman Levin College of Urban Affairs and the Cleveland-Marshall College of Law at Cleveland State University. He also serves as director of the college's JD/MPA and JD/MUPDD joint degree programs. Weinstein is a nationally recognized expert on planning law who has published more than 70 books, treatise revisions, and law journal articles. He serves as a reporter for APA's *Land Use Law & Zoning Digest*, and is a past-Chair of APA's Planning & Law Division. His experience with sign regulation includes serving as chair of the American Bar Association's Subcommittee on Land Use and the First Amendment since 1982.

*This report is being provided in pdf version only. It may be published by APA in hard copy at a later date. The views expressed in this report are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of APA or the sponsor.*

*Cover design by Lisa Barton*

---

The Planning Advisory Service is a subscription service offered by the Research Department of the American Planning Association. Eight reports are produced each year. Subscribers also receive the *PAS Memo* each month and have use of the Inquiry Answering Service. Frank S. So, Executive Director; Sylvia Lewis, Publications Director; William Klein, Director of Research.

Planning Advisory Service Reports are produced in the Research Department of APA. James Hecimovich, Editor; Marya Morris, Assistant Editor; Lisa Barton, Design Associate.

© June 2001 by the American Planning Association. APA's publications office is at 122 S. Michigan Ave., Suite 1600, Chicago, IL 60603. E-mail: pasreports@planning.org. APA headquarters office is at 1776 Massachusetts Ave., N.W., Washington, DC 20036.

---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Context-Sensitive Signage Design

MARYA MORRIS, AICP,  
MARK L. HINSHAW, FAICP,  
DOUGLAS MACE,  
AND ALAN WEINSTEIN

<b>Acknowledgments</b> .....	<b>v</b>
<b>Chapter 1. Planning for Signs, by Marya Morris</b> .....	<b>1</b>
Planners and Signs .....	1
Sign Manufacturers and Planning .....	2
An Overview of the Sign Industry .....	4
Sign Technology .....	5
Art and Graphic Design .....	6
<b>Chapter 2. On-Premise Signs and Traffic Safety, by Douglas Mace</b> .....	<b>9</b>
Research Relating On-Premise Signs and Traffic Safety .....	10
A Theory of Driver Behavior .....	11
General Principles of Highway Signing .....	17
Toward an Effective and Safe Sign System .....	20
Cooperative Triangulation .....	32
<b>Chapter 3. Aesthetic Context: Designing for Place, by Mark Hinshaw</b> . . . .	<b>37</b>
Policies .....	39
Programs .....	39
Projects .....	40
Engaging the Public in Urban Design .....	41
Establishing a Foundation for Sign Regulation .....	46
Understanding the Components of Context .....	51
Evaluating the Place—A Typology .....	59
Characteristics of Places .....	70
Implications .....	73
<b>Chapter 4. The Economic Context of Signs, by Marya Morris</b> .....	<b>75</b>
Signs as Identification, Advertising, and Wayfinding Devices . . . .	76
The Complex Relationship Between Economics and Aesthetics . . . .	77
The Economic Context of Signs .....	82
Research on the Economic Value of Signage .....	83
The Signage Needs of Retail and Service Businesses .....	91
Signage Needs of National Chains Versus Small Independent Businesses .....	92
Conclusions .....	94

<b>Chapter 5. Design Review, Permitting, and Recordkeeping,</b>	
<b>by Mark Hinshaw</b>	<b>107</b>
The Sign Permitting Process	100
Administering Design Review for Signs	103
The Ordinance	110
<b>Chapter 6. Legal Issues in the Regulation of On-Premise Signs,</b>	
<b>by Alan Weinstein</b>	<b>119</b>
Sign Regulation and Police Power	120
Sign Regulation and the First Amendment	120
Recurring Problems in Local Government Regulation of Signs	129
The Takings Issue: Requiring the Removal or Amortization of	
On-Premise Commercial Signs	136
Provisions for Enforcement	139
Provisions for Flexibility	142
Commercial On-Premise Signs and the First Amendment	144
Time, Place, or Manner Regulation of	
On-Premise Commercial Signs	144
When Is a Sign Content-Based?	147
Recommendations and Guidelines	153
<b>Chapter 7. Reaching Consensus on Sign Regulation,</b>	
<b>by Marya Morris</b>	<b>159</b>
Forming a Sign Ordinance Committee	160
Case Studies	164
Conclusion	178

## Acknowledgments

**M**arya Morris wishes to acknowledge the many people who committed their time and expertise to the creation of this report, including Kirk Brimley, Young Electric Sign Company in Salt Lake City and former government affairs liaison with the International Sign Association; Bob Brown, City of Cleveland assistant director of planning; Mark Hinshaw, principal, LMN Architects, Seattle; Elizabeth Jackson, president, The Urban Agenda, Washington, D.C. (former executive director of International Downtown Association and the Society for Environmental Graphic Design); Douglas Mace, principal, The Last Resource, Inc., Bellefonte, Pennsylvania; and Alan Weinstein, Professor, Cleveland Marshall College of Law.

Thanks also to the planners and sign industry representatives who provided information, advice, and assistance throughout the project, in particular Gordon Baker, Bob Brown, Enrique Diaz, Eugene Lathrop, Leo March, Jay Ogle, and Dennis Wilson. Charlie Floyd, Eric Damian Kelly, Daniel R. Mandelker, and Randal Morrison allowed me to bounce legal questions off them on numerous occasions. Karen Musech of the Professional Awning Manufacturers Association provided photos and other input on awning signs. Young Electric Sign Company of Salt Lake City and Neon Products of Canada each hosted me for tours of their sign manufacturing operations.

Mike Davidson, Kitty Haak, Martin Ince, Elizabeth Longley, and Marty Roupe all got in their cars or out on foot at my request to take photos of signs, for which I am grateful. Marty Roupe was an APA research associate on the project in its beginning stages.

Finally thank you to Jim Hecimovich and Bill Klein in the APA research department, APA staff attorney Bernie Dworski, and Lisa Barton and Susan Deegan in the APA publications department for their support and contribution to the project and this report.